ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON NOVEL FOODS AND PROCESSES

DRAFT INITIAL OPINION ON AN APPLICATION UNDER THE NOVEL FOODS REGULATION FOR D-RIBOSE

UK OPINION

ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON NOVEL FOODS AND PROCESSES

DRAFT INITIAL OPINION ON AN APPLICATION UNDER THE NOVEL FOODS REGULATION FOR D-RIBOSE

Applicant: Bioenergy Life Science Inc.

Responsible Person: Alex Xue, Ph. D Executive VP & Chief Technology Officer 13840 Johnson Street NE Minneapolis, MN 55304 Direct: 763.746.3924 Fax: 763.746.1974

EC Classification: 1.2

Introduction

- An application has been submitted by Bioenergy Life Science, Inc. for authorisation of D-Ribose as a novel ingredient in the EU. The application was originally accepted by the UK Competent Authority on 17 March 2008 and was discussed by the Committee at meetings during 2008-2009, culminating in a request from the Committee for additional information to resolve uncertainties arising from a study on reproductive toxicity.
- 2. The applicant sought further advice from the Committee in April 2013 (ACNFP/110/2) on what additional information should be provided. The Committee advised that it did not see, at this stage, the need for additional animal studies and it would consider D-ribose in the light of a revised dossier in which the applicant should incorporate the additional information provided during the 2008/9 discussions, along with any new data that is relevant to the safety of D-ribose.
- 3. The revised dossier was initially reviewed at the November 2013 meeting. The main changes to the original document are:
 - Updated intake estimates;
 - Updated post-market monitoring information;
 - More detailed discussion of findings from the reproductive toxicity study;

- Additional commentary on the potential effects of D-ribose on glucose metabolism and on uric acid levels.
- 4. Given the time that has elapsed since the original application and the resulting turnover in membership of the Committee, the complete dataset from the updated dossier was presented to the Committee as if it was a new application.
- 5. D-Ribose is a naturally occurring 5-carbon sugar that is present in all living cells. Phosphate forms of ribose have been detected in numerous human and animal tissues and cells. Ribose is a component of RNA, which is produced by the transcription of DNA, adenosine triphosphate (ATP), the reduced form of nicotinamide adenosine dinucleotide (NADH), and other chemicals important to cellular metabolism. Ribose is also a precursor for the synthesis of purine nucleotides. Endogenously, ribose is synthesised from the conversion of glucose *via* the pentose phosphate pathway (PPP).
- 6. D-Ribose is produced by the applicant by fermentation, using a nongenetically modified strain of *Bacillus subtilis* (*B. subtilis*) that is unable to utilise D-Ribose for downstream metabolism due to a disruption in the D-Ribose metabolic pathway.
- 7. Ribose has a sweet taste, approximately equivalent to that of glucose. The applicant states that D-Ribose is intended for use as an energy source in a range of foods, including food supplements and foods for special medical uses.
- 8. The present application for authorisation of D-Ribose was prepared pursuant to Commission Recommendation (97/618/EC) of 29 July 1997 concerning the scientific aspects and presentation of information necessary to support applications for the placing on the market of novel foods and novel food ingredients. D-Ribose has been classified as a pure chemical or simple mixture from a non-GM source (class 1.2). The requirements for a submission for this class are as follows:

I	Specification of the NF	X
II	Effect of the production process applied to the NF	X
III	History of the organism used as the source of the NF	X
IV	Effect of the genetic modification on the properties of the host organism	-
V	Genetic stability of the GMO	-
VI	Specificity of expression of novel genetic material	-
VII	Transfer of genetic material from GM microorganisms	-

VIII	Ability to survive in and colonise the human gut	-
IX	Anticipated intake/extent of use of the NF	X
Х	Information from previous human exposure to the NF or its source	I
XI	Nutritional information on the NF	X
XII	Microbiological information on the NF	X
XIII	Toxicological information on the NF	X

- 9. The information presented in the dossier is structured accordingly and is considered below under these schemes.
- 10. A non-confidential version of the original application dossier was placed on the FSA website to allow the public to input into the UK assessment. No comments were received.

I. Specification of the novel food Annex 1, p 5-8 and p 16-17

- 11. D-Ribose is a dry powdery product that is white to slightly yellow in colour, of high purity (minimum 97%), and containing low levels of arsenic (<1 mg/kg) and lead (<0.1 mg/kg). Other heavy metals were not analysed.
- 12. Batch on batch variation was assessed by chemical and physical analyses of five different lots of D-Ribose, as shown in Annex 1, page 8. Certificates of analysis for the different lots can be found in Annex 1, Appendix B. The results of these analyses indicated a narrow range of variation in composition and contaminants. The stability of D-Ribose has been studied in different packaging (Annex 1, p 16-17) and the shelf-life of D-Ribose was determined to be 24 months at room temperature. The melting point for D-Ribose in the specification is reported over a wide range (80-90°C), although analyses of five different lots of D-Ribose showed the range of melting points to be narrow (84-85°C), as might be expected for a product of high chemical purity.
- 13. At the request of the ACNFP the applicant provided further details on the method of analysis used for D-ribose. The Committee was satisfied with the information provided (ACNFP114/3).

II. Effect of the production process applied to the novel food Annex 1, p 9-16; PROTECT - COMMERCIAL

- 14. D-Ribose is produced by fermentation using a transketolase-deficient strain of B. subtilis. The metabolic pathway for D-ribose production in transketolasedeficient strains of *Bacillus* spp is illustrated in Figure II.2-1 (Annex 1 p 13).
- 15. The production strain is unable to utilise D-Ribose, which accumulates in the fermentation medium. The medium is centrifuged to remove bacteria and solid particles and then filtered, decolourised and desalted with successive steps using activated carbon and other absorbents. Purified D-ribose is concentrated by evaporation and crystallised using ethanol. D-ribose crystals are recovered by centrifugation before being dried and packaged. The raw materials used in the production of D-ribose and components of the fermentation media are listed in Annex 1 p 10-11. Specifications of the raw materials are provided in Annex 1, Appendix C.

- 16. The applicant states that D-Ribose is unlikely to contain the production organism and is free from any bacteria (including the production organism) or bacterial components. No protein was detected using the Bradford assay (detection limit 0.1 µg/ml) in samples of 20% D-Ribose solution from six randomly selected lots of Bioenergy D-Ribose (Annex 1, Appendix E) and residual ethanol levels were in the range 0.01% 0.02%. Tests on three batches showed only low levels of bacterial endotoxins (polyliposaccharides) at 20% or less of the specified upper limit of 25 Endotoxin Units per gram.
- 17. At the request of the ACNFP the applicant carried out further analysis of D-ribose for the presence of protein. Additional analysis of 5 lots of D-ribose using the Kjeldahl method was carried out. No detectable protein was found in any of these samples (LOD equivalent to 0.15%-0.16% protein), confirming the previous results obtained using the Bradford assay (ACNFP114/3).

III. History of the organism used as a source of the novel food ${}_{Annex\,1,\,p\,21\text{-}24}$

- 18. *Bacillus spp.* are Gram positive rod-shaped, spore forming bacteria. *B.subtilis* is found in soil and naturally present in foods such as spices and milk powder. A long history of safe food use has been established for *B.subtilis.* For example, it is involved in the production of some traditional fermented foods (soy sauce, soybean paste and tofu) and in the production of certain chemicals (ribose, riboflavin and other metabolites).
- 19. Several D-Ribose producing *Bacillus spp.* are listed in the American Type Culture Collection (ATCC). These strains, developed by chemical or UV mutation, are unable to utilise D-Ribose as a result of a lack of transketolase activity. D-Ribose producing *Bacillus spp.* are asporeogenous as they are unable to convert ribose into ribitol and teichoic acids, which are required for spore formation. Bioenergy D-Ribose is produced using *B. subtilis* ATCC 21951, which was originally deposited as *Bacillus pumilus* but later re-classified.
- 20. The *B. subtilis* group of the genus *Bacillus* is genotypically and phenotypically distinct from the *B. cereus* group, which contains the pathogens *B. anthracis* and *B. cereus*. The complete genome sequence for *B. subtilis* is established and the genes encoding virulence factors in *B. anthracis* and *B. cereus* are not present and there are no known plasmids encoding for antibiotic resistance. Further information can be found in Annex 1, Appendix F.

IX. Anticipated intake/extent of use of the novel food Annex 1, p 25-36

21. The applicant intends to use their D-Ribose product as an ingredient in a variety of foods. A list of products and the proposed food uses and levels was

presented in the updated application. However, the ACNFP considered that the most up to date and relevant data on exposure are contained in two papers by Griffiths et al. (2007a, b), and from the 13 week study described in Griffiths et al (2007a) concluded that a NOAEL of 4g/kg bw/day should be used for D-ribose. In the light of this the applicant reassessed the intake levels using the most current UK NDNS dataset (2008-2012) and also eliminated several proposed uses of D-ribose, as well as reducing the inclusion rates in several food categories (table 1).

- 22. The applicant has argued that the 95th percentile intake estimates should be used to represent "worst-case" scenario exposure levels; arguing that the 97.5th percentile was not a realistic measure of this level of exposure since values at this extreme end of the range can be subject to large statistical variation given the smaller numbers of subjects that are available to assess this percentile of exposure. The Committee did not agree with this argument, as there are still sufficient numbers at the 97.5th percentile to allow statistical comparisons to be made. It was acknowledged however, that the intake assessment is likely to over-estimate actual intake levels, given that, for the purposes of the intake assessment, all foods within each category were considered to contain D-ribose at the level indicated.
- 23. The revised intake assessment presented below in Tables 1 and 2 utilised the most recent UK NDNS data sets (which included the year 2012). As shown in Table 1, the applicant has eliminated and/or decreased the use rate of D-ribose in various food categories. Specifically, use in "biscuits, cakes, pastries, doughnuts, scones and ice cream" has been removed, and inclusion rates for use in fruit/vegetable juices, yogurt, and energy drinks reduced to 0.5, 1.5 and 3 g/serving, respectively. In addition, in the "cakes, pastries, muffins, doughnuts and scones" food category, only use in muffins remains at 2.2 g/serving.
- 24. Based on the revised intended use categories and levels, and through use of the UK NDNS (2008-2012) survey data, substantially lower estimates of intake at the mean and 95th and percentiles were obtained in comparison to intake estimates determined originally.

Table 1. Summary of the individual proposed food uses and use levels for D-Ribose in the UK

Food Category	Proposed Use	D-Ribose per Serving (g)	Serving Size (g)*	Use Level (g/100g)	
Biscuits	Cereal bars	0.62	31	2.0	
Buns, Cakes, Pastries and Fruit Pies	Huffins	2.2	70	3.1	
Chocolate Confectionery	Chocolate confectionery (excluding chocolate bars) ¹	0.68	40	1.7	
Flavoured Drinks ²	Carbonated Soft Drinks, Not Low Calorie (Non-Cola)	1.0	250	0.4	
	Milk Drinks (excluding malts and shakes)	0.8	200	0.4	
	Ready-to-Drink Soft Drinks, Not Low Calorie	1.0	250	0.4	
	Reduced Calorie Beverages ³	1.0	250	0.4	
	Sports, Isotonic, and Energy Drinks	3.0	250	1.2	
Foods intended for	Meal Replacement Beverages	1.0	250	0.4	
Particular Nutritional Uses	Meal Replacement Bars and Energy Bars	3.0	60	5.0	
Fruit & Vegetable Juices	Fruit Juice	0.50	160	0.3125	
	Vegetable Juice	0.50	240	0.208	
Sugar Confectionery	Hard and soft confectionery	0.7	35	2.0	
Tea, Coffee and Water	Instant and Herbal Teas only	1.33	190	0.7	
Yogurt, Fromage Frais and Dairy Desserts	Yogurt (including frozen yogurt; excluding yogurt drinks)	1.5	125	1.2	

*Serving sizes are based on the UK Food Portion Sizes handbook (FSA, 2002) and from manufacturers' websites ¹ This includes chocolate confectionery, such as chocolate coated nuts, fruit, caramels, chocolate eggs, bonbons,

² Flavoured drinks do not include any sugar-free or low-calorie varieties as these beverages were found to have very low carbohydrate content, and therefore not a target for D-ribose
³ Reduced calorie beverages are only included if they have a carbohydrate content >0.2 g/100mls

Table 2. Summary of the Estimated Daily Per Kilogram Body Weight Intake of D-Ribose from
Proposed Food-Uses in the UK by Population Group (2008-2012 NDNS Data)

Population Group	Age	All-Person Consumption (mg/kg bw/day)			All-Users Consumption (mg/kg bw/day)						
	Group (Years)			P	ercentile	9	%	N	Maan	Percentile	
			Mean	90 th	95 th	97.5 th	Users		Mean	90 th	95 th
Toddlers	1 to 3	62	126	149	183	94.2	314	66	126	150	187
Children	4 to 10	46	91	114	131	94.9	737	49	93	115	132
Female Teenagers	11 to 18	22	47	57	76	89.1	375	24	49	60	84
Male Teenagers	11 to 18	27	62	75	93	90.6	389	30	64	75	93
Female Adults	19 to 64	15	33	48	65	79.6	692	18	40	54	76
Male Adults	19 to 64	12	31	42	63	72.6	470	17	34	53	67
Elderly	65 and older	11	26	38	49	71.5	272	15	32	44	52

25. To assess the safety of the estimated intakes of D-ribose in the various subpopulations, the mean, 95th and 97.5th percentile intake values were compared to the recommended NOAEL of 4 g/kg bw/day (see paragraph 19). The 'margin of exposure' (MOE) values were calculated by dividing the NOAEL of 4,000 mg/kg bw/day by each of the mean, 95th and 97.5th percentile intake values for each sub-population, respectively. The MOE values obtained are presented in Table 3.

Uses in the UK by Population Group (2008-2012 NDNS Data)						
	MOE Values (based on a NOAEL of 4 g/kg bw/day)					
Population Group	Mean	Mean 90 th percentile 95 th percentile				
Toddlers	61	32	27	21		
Children	82	43	35	30		
Female Teenagers	167	82	67	48		
Male Teenagers	133	62	53	43		
Female Adults	222	100	74	53		
Male Adults	235	118	75	60		
Elderly	267	125	91	77		

Table 3. Summary of MOE Calculations for Intake of D-Ribose from Proposed Food-Uses in the UK by Population Group (2008-2012 NDNS Data)

26. Following revision of the intake data for the "all users" category, toddlers remain the subpopulation with the highest mg/kg bw/day intakes. This, as is

well known, is due in large part to lower body weights (assuming equal consumption of food categories) of this age group. For toddlers, the mean, 95th and 97.5th percentile intake levels were estimated to be 66, 150 and 187 mg/kg bw/day, respectively. Children (aged 4 to 10) had the next highest intake levels at 49, 132 and 115 mg/kg bw/day. Mean intakes in teenagers ranged from 24 (female) to 30 (male) mg/kg bw/day; with corresponding 95th and 97.5th percentile estimates of 60/84 and 75/93 mg/kg bw/day respectively. The lowest intake levels were in adults and the elderly: for adults the mean levels were 17/18 (males/females) mg/kg bw/day with 95th/97.5th percentile levels of 53/67 and 53/67 (for males/females) mg/kg bw/day respectively. For the elderly, the mean, 95th and 97.5th percentile levels are 15, 44 and 52 respectively.

- 27. For the mean/97.5th percentile exposure levels, the MOE ranged from 61/21 in toddlers, to 267/77 in the elderly. The ACNFP did not consider that these MOEs indicated any safety concerns. In addition, the applicant argues that there is no indication from the literature; either from clinical trials (*e.g.*, Van Gammeren *et al.*, 2002; Omran *et al.*, 2003; Hellsten *et al.*, 2004; Gebhart and Jorgenson, 2004; Teitelbaum *et al.*, 2006) or from animal toxicology studies (Griffiths *et al.*, 2007a, b) of any notable adverse effects of D-ribose consumption, even at exposure levels higher than those calculated here.
- 28. The Committee was content with the new intakes data presented by the applicant and, under the revised intended conditions of use and using a NOAEL of 4 g/kg bw/day (see paragraph 19), that consumption of D-ribose posed no safety concerns to humans.
- 29. The applicant also proposes that D-Ribose will be available as a food supplement at a recommended dosage of up to 10 g per day. This use is not included in the intake estimates presented here, as the applicant considers that D-Ribose used as a food supplement would typically be taken only as an alternative to the foods listed in table 1.

X. Information from previous exposure to the novel food

- Annex 1, p 37-38, 73
- 30. The applicant notes that ribose is a natural component of the diet. There are no estimates of dietary intake, but endogenous production in humans is of the order of 3-15 grams/day.
- 31. Adverse reaction records have been maintained by Bioenergy Life Science, Inc. for D-Ribose sold in the US since 2004. Approximately 1900 metric tonnes have been sold in the US, equivalent to approximately 1.3 billion servings. Thirty one adverse reactions reports have been received from customers in relation to D-Ribose supplements and no reports have been received for foods with added D-Ribose. The adverse reports are summarised in the following table,

categorised according to severity (life threatening, major, minor, or nuisance) and type.

present)	1	
Severity	Туре	Description (Number of Reports)
Nuisance	CNS	Headache (1); Light-headedness (1)
Nuisance	MS	Felt funny (1); weakness/fatigue (1), Swollen leg (2)
Nuisance	Derm	Rash (3), Itching (3)
Nuisance	Endo	Transient elevated blood sugar in diabetic customers (4)
Nuisance	GI	Diarrhoea (3); upset stomach (5); excess gas (1); constipation (2)
Minor	CV	Transient racing heart, edgy (3)
Minor	MS	Muscle tightness (1)

Summary of the type and severity of adverse reactions for D-Ribose (1 January 2005 to present)

Type of adverse reactions:

Cardiovascular (CV), Respiratory, Central Nervous System (CNS), Urinary, Musculoskeletal (MS), Immunological, Endocrine (Endo), Oncologic, Gastrointestinal (GI), Dermatological (Derm) and other.

XI. Nutritional information on the novel food

Annex 1, p 39-40

- 32. D-Ribose has a calorific value of 4kcal/g, which is equivalent to that of other carbohydrates.
- 33. The applicant has provided a description of the metabolic fate of ingested D-Ribose (Annex 1, p 45). Ingested D-Ribose enters the pentose phosphate pathway downstream of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase and 6phosphogluconate dehydrogenase and is made available for flux down the purine nucleotide pathway of purine and pyrimidine synthesis. When pentose phosphates are not required for purine nucleotide synthesis in muscle or when ribose is present in excess amounts, they are recycled through glycolysis mainly in the liver via conversion into fructose-6-phosphate, fructose 1, 6 bisphosphate and glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate and eventually form carbon dioxide and water, yielding energy via ATP turnover. Fructose-6-phosphate is further converted to glucose-6-phosphate, which in turn is converted to glucose-1-phosphate and incorporated into glycogen for storage.
- 34. Significant decreases in blood glucose levels have been reported in some clinical studies (Annex 1, p 69, 71-72, 74-76) but this has only been observed where subjects were given a bolus of D-Ribose of 10 g or greater with no additional source of energy after an overnight fast. For the intended uses proposed by the applicant, D-Ribose per serving size would not exceed 5.3 g and an additional carbohydrate energy source would be included with D-Ribose which the applicant states will compensate for any effects of lowered blood glucose. The applicant acknowledges that the proposed use in reduced calorie

drinks will not provide additional carbohydrate energy sources but these beverages will contain only 1 g of D-Ribose per serving, below the level where glucose lowering effects were observed. The applicant has concluded that D-Ribose consumption should not be a risk for diabetics.

35. The mechanisms of the alterations in glucose levels following large bolus doses of D-Ribose cannot be explained fully by an increase in insulin levels. Other possible mechanisms include a reduction in glycogenolysis, in response either to a ribose-induced increase in intracellular ATP levels or to an inhibitory effect of ribose on phosphoglucomutase, one of the enzymes involved in glycogenolysis.

XII. Microbiological information on the novel food

Annex 1, p 41-42

- 36. The microbiological specification for the novel ingredient is as follows:
 - Total microbial count ≤100 CFU/g
 - Salmonella spp. absent in 25 g
 - Coliforms ≤10 CFU/g
 - Yeast and mould \leq 100 CFU/g
- 37. Microbiological analysis of five lots of D-Ribose confirmed that they all met these specifications.

XIII. Toxicological information on the novel food

Annex 1, p 43-78

38. A number of toxicological studies have been described in the dossier as demonstrating the safety of D-Ribose. Animal studies, mutagenicity studies and genotoxicity studies are summarised in the tables below.

(a) Animal Studies

Source of D-Ribose	Tests	Result
Bioenergy	Sub-chronic toxicity (13 weeks) at doses up to 20% in the diet, equivalent to 0-15 and 0- 15.7 g/kg bodyweight per day for males and females, respectively	NOAEL was established to be the highest dose, equivalent to a mean daily intake of 15 and 15.7 g/kg bodyweight per day for males and females, respectively
Bioenergy	Developmental toxicity at doses equivalent to 0-9.91 g/kg bodyweight per day	NOAEL for teratogenicity was established at 9.91 g/kg bodyweight per day, but a "clearly undisputable NOAEL for teratogenicity was at a D- ribose intake of between 3.64 and 4.61 g/kg bodyweight per day"

(b) Mutagenicity and genotoxicity studies

Source of D-Ribose	Tests	Result	
Bioenergy	Bacterial reverse mutation assay using 4 strains of histidine-requiring <i>Salmonella typhimurium</i> and 1 strain of tryptophan-requiring <i>Escherichia coli</i> (with and without metabolic activation)	Negative on all strains	
Bioenergy	<i>In vitro</i> chromosomal aberration assay in Chinese hamster ovary cells (with and without metabolic activation)	Negative	
Bioenergy	Gene mutation assay at the thymidine kinase locus of mouse lymphoma L5178Y cells	Negative	
Bioenergy	In vivo rat bone marrow micronucleus assay	Negative	
Other sources	Bacterial reverse mutation assay using 2 strains of histidine-requiring Salmonella typhimurium	Negative	

- 39. In the developmental study, offspring were examined at 21 days of age and the only potentially adverse findings were that the offspring of rats fed the two highest doses (10% and 20% ribose in the diet) showed an increased incidence of a condition called "wavy rib" and some signs of delayed ossification. The Committee has previously discussed these findings at length and concluded that further research is unlikely to provide useful information. The applicant discusses these results in pages 56-58 of Annex 1 and concludes that these are transient variations that are related to maternal stress associated with the very large amounts of monosaccharide in the D-Ribose diets.
- 40. The ACNFP sought the advice of an independent expert who concluded:

'it is not considered that the data reported in this study indicate a significant toxic action which is directly attributable to a specific action of D-ribose after consumption. It is possible that these effects may be due to nutritional imbalance in the rats because of the high mass/volume of the doses of D-ribose given. These effects may however be due to an interaction with the insulin/glucose pathway. It has been shown that the foetuses of diabetic rats have an increase in incidence of skeletal malformations. As the plasma insulin and glucose levels were not quantified in this study it is not possible to identify the diabetic status of these rats. However, the doses of D-ribose used in this study are well in excess of those proposed by the applicant, so we would not anticipate that these effects would be relevant for humans at the proposed intake levels.'

41. <u>Human studies</u> investigating effects of D-Ribose (seventeen oral administration studies and four intravenous administration studies) are described in Annex 1 p 51-63. The majority of these are efficacy studies with the recording of side effects. Doses ranged from 2 to 270 g/day. The applicant has

stated that overall D-Ribose has been shown to be well tolerated with no adverse effects reported other than diarrhoea at daily doses of 60 g or greater. These doses are five times higher than the estimated 97.5th percentile intake of D-Ribose from the applicant's proposed food uses (11 g/person/day) so the applicant does not envisage any safety concerns for the proposed uses.

- 42. D-Ribose administration can be associated with blood glucose lowering effects. For example, asymptomatic and transient hypoglycaemic effects (returning to baseline levels approximately 2 hours after D-Ribose ingestion) were observed with bolus doses of 10 g or greater in healthy individuals, where D-Ribose was administered with no other added source of energy after an overnight fast (Annex 1 p 55-56, study by Fenstad et al., 2000). The applicant has explained that this should not pose a problem for their proposed uses of D-Ribose.
- Single oral doses of 5 and 10 g of D-Ribose resulted in a significant increase 43. in blood uric acid levels at 30 and 60 minutes after administration compared to a 2 g dose in healthy individuals (Annex 1 p 65-66, study by Fenstad et al., 2000). However, this response was not dose dependent as uric acid levels were lower after ingestion of 10 g of D-Ribose than after ingestion of 5 g. The authors suggest that this may be a result of D-Ribose-induced purine synthesis, with uric acid being a catabolic end product of adenosine and inosine. The applicant notes that, while very high doses of D-Ribose have been linked with increased uric acid levels in some studies, the intake of D-Ribose at the levels described in Section IX above will not be a concern for individuals with hyperuricemia.

Allergenicity Annex 1, p 79

44. The applicant notes that *B.subtilis* is unlikely to be present in the final D-Ribose preparation due to the purification process employed during manufacture. Additionally, analysis of samples of D-ribose using the Bradford assay (LOD 0.1 µg/ml) and the Kjeldahl method (LOD equivalent to 0.15%-0.16% protein) did not reveal the presence of any proteins above the respective LODs. As a result the applicant suggests that the allergenic potential of D-Ribose is limited.

Labelling Annex 1, p 36

45. The applicant has provided the following labelling suggestion:

'The designation "D-ribose" shall be displayed on the labelling of the product in the list of ingredients of foodstuffs containing it. The food product may also incorporate on the label the words "contains an additional source of D-Ribose" in a typeface that is at least the same size as the list of ingredients itself.'

Consumer access and choice

- 46. The Secretariat has considered the issues of access and choice in relation to D-Ribose. If authorised, D-Ribose would be available for use in products across the UK and subsequently in other EU Member States. In practical terms, access to products containing D-Ribose could be limited by a high price or by limited geographic distribution, which are both driven by commercial considerations that cannot be predicted at this stage.
- 47. It is envisaged that the introduction of products containing D-Ribose will increase existing consumer choice. The consumer would be aware of the presence of D-Ribose through the ingredient list and, most likely through special marketing that highlights its contribution to the nutrient composition of foods.

Discussion: The Committee reviewed the applicant's revised dossier and was generally content with the information provided.

The Committee noted that the novel ingredient altered glucose metabolism when taken at a high dosage under fasting conditions, but was satisfied that concern was addressed by ensuring that D-ribose is only proposed for addition to foods that contain other carbohydrate energy sources. In addition, when used in reduced calorie drinks which will not provide additional carbohydrate energy sources, these beverages will contain only 1 g of D-Ribose per serving, below the level where glucose lowering effects were observed. It recommended labelling 'not to be taken on an empty stomach' as a warning against possible hypoglycaemic effects for food supplements containing D-ribose.

CONCLUSION

48. The Advisory Committee on Novel Foods and Processes is satisfied by the evidence provided by Bioenergy Inc. that D-ribose is acceptable as a novel food ingredient, subject to the applicant's adherence to the proposed labelling requirements described above.

21 December 2015